



United Nations Environment Programme

EP

UNEP(DEPI)/MED CC.2/Inf.4
9 March 2009

ENGLISH



MEDITERRANEAN ACTION PLAN

Second meeting of the Compliance Committee

Athens, Greece, 26-27 March 2009

Proposed Effectiveness Indicators

Introductory remarks

The 15th Meeting of the Contracting Parties to the Barcelona Convention held in Almeria, Spain (15-18 January 2008) decided to *establish a Working Group on Effectiveness that will work through electronic tools in order to develop, during the next biennium, a list of indicators on the effectiveness of measures taken to implement the Convention and its Protocols and the decisions adopted by the Meetings of the Contracting Parties, and to guide the work for the preparation of the Regional Assessment Report on Implementation for the years 2006-2007, for submission to and consideration by the 16th Meeting of the Contracting Parties in 2009.*

In addition to it, the 15th Meeting of the Contracting Parties requested the Secretariat to propose, in close collaboration with all MAP Components, the set of effectiveness indicators for discussion by the group.

In view of implementing this Decision, the Executive Coordination Panel agreed at its meeting in Malta in May 2008, to establish a group of experts composed of all MAP components in order to identify and prepare the first set of effectiveness indicators. It also recommended to use for this purpose, a tool developed by Blue Plan and successfully implemented in the framework of CAMP projects sustainability indicators development, namely the method *IMAGINE : a Systemic and Prospective Sustainability Analysis*.

The Secretariat, with the technical support from Blue Plan, coordinated the work of all concerned MAP components, namely MEDPOL, CP/RAC, REMPEC, SPA RAC, PAP/RAC and INFO/RAC for the identification and selection of the first set of effectiveness indicators for submission to the virtual working group on Reporting as decided by the 15th Meeting of the Contracting Parties in Almeria.

With regard to the proposed set of effectiveness indicators, the following deliberations may help reflection and consideration by the virtual working group:

1. The effectiveness indicators approved by the 15th Meeting of the Contracting Parties held in Almeria, together with the reporting format for the Barcelona Convention and its Protocols will be not subject to discussion by the virtual working group. For easy reference they are presented in the information document UNEP(DEPI)/MED Inf 1. In this regard, no new effectiveness indicators are proposed for the Offshore Protocol.
2. MSSD indicators were all reviewed in view of ensuring harmonization, where possible.
3. A number of marine impact pollution indicators, currently under development by MED POL, will be considered in the future for their proposal as effectiveness indicators.
4. ICZM Protocol effectiveness indicators will be proposed for discussion at a later stage once its reporting format is developed and agreed.
5. In identifying and selecting the set of indicators, the Secretariat and the MAP components made an in-depth analysis of the legally binding requirement of the Convention and its Protocols, as well as of the reporting format adopted for each legal instrument, the Guidelines and the regional action plans and strategies. The analysis also ensured that:
 - *different types of legal, institutional, technical, administrative and enforcement measures are undertaken in a consistent manner by the Contracting Parties (performance indicators) so that the implementation system is effectively in place;*

- *to some extent, consideration is given to the outputs of the measures taken in short and mid term (impact indicators);*
 - *the purpose of the measures taken in view of their long term effect of their implementation is fully or partially achieved (sustainability indicators).*
6. There was a need to prioritize the proposed indicators on the basis of the following criteria:
- Relevance¹ with the legally binding requirements of the Convention and its Protocols;
 - Availability of data²;
 - Collection of data/Reporting process and institutions in charge³.
7. For each indicator presented in Annex I to this document the following information is given:
- a) relevant article/s of the Convention/Protocols
 - b) Narrative/action/criteria
 - c) Objective of the indicator
 - d) Relevance
 - e) Availability
 - f) Targeted trends
 - g) Year (no value is proposed, subject to discussion by the members of the working group)
8. In order to be in a position to submit to the MAP focal points and the Contracting Parties meetings the final set of draft effectiveness indicators for discussion and approval, it is proposed that the internal consultation within the RACs and MEDPOL focal points system is finalized according to the time frame presented in the Table below.

Time table and responsibility

Circulation of the draft to MAP and RAC Focal points and contact points on Reporting	Beginning of February 2009	MEDU
Submission of inputs by MAP and RAC Focal points and contact points on Reporting	February - March 2009	Contracting Parties/MEDU
Incorporation of any comment, inputs as appropriate	Early April 2009	BP and all the other MAP components
Discussion of the proposal at each component's focal points meeting	April/May 2009	Respective focal points meeting
Preparation of an integrated draft document for submission to the MAP Focal Points meeting	June 2009	MEDU and all components

¹ Relevance : 0 -No relevance it is eliminatory, 1-average relevance; 2-very much relevant

² Availability of data: 0-No; 1-in the long term; 2- available

³ Possibility to collect data and institutions in charge: 0-No; 1-to be defined; 2-exists

Barcelona Convention

Article	"narrative", Actions/Criteria	Objectives	Indicators	Relevance	Availability	Targeted trends	Year	Targets
	Status of Ratification and the entry into force of MAP legal instruments	Obligations under the Convention and its Protocols are legally binding for those Contracting parties that have them ratified and for which these legal instruments are in force	1) Ratio of the number of Contracting parties for which MAP legal instruments are in force over the total number of Contracting Parties	2	2, National Reports	Increase		
			2) Number of MAP legal instruments entered into force	2	2, National Reports	Increase		
Article 14	According to Article 14, the Contracting parties shall adopt legislation to implement the convention and its protocols.	To provide information on the legal/regulatory aspects of the implementation of the Convention and its Protocols	3) Ratio of the number of the provisions of the Convention and its Protocols implemented through the adoption of legal and regulatory measure to the total number of provisions identified in the reporting format over the number of the Contracting Parties	2	2, National Reports	Increase		
Article 4	According article 4 of the Convention, the Contracting parties should pledge themselves to pursue the protection of the marine environment and national resources of the Mediterranean seas area as an integral part of the development process	To provide information on the integration of the protection of the environment of the Mediterranean sea area into domestic sustainable and or sectorial development policies	4) Ratio of the number of the Contracting parties that have incorporated key Barcelona Convention and its protocols priorities and the related commitments into their domestic policies over the total number of the Contracting Parties.	2	2, national reports	Increase		
Several articles	A number of provisions of the Barcelona Convention and its Protocols provide for the Contracting Parties to designate competent authorities	To provide information on the status of the institutional aspects of implementation of the Convention and its protocols	5) Ratio of the number of the Contracting Parties that have established the necessary institutions or designated competent authorities to implement the Convention and its Protocols over the total number of the Contracting Parties	1	2, National Reports	Increase		
Article 12	Article 12 provides for the Contracting parties to take necessary measures to ensure access to information and public participation as appropriate	To provide information on the status of the implementation of Article 12 at the regional level on public awareness and participation as an important tool to achieve effective implementation of the Convention and its Protocols	6) Ratio of the number of the Contracting parties that publish assessment reports or data regarding the state of environment of the Mediterranean sea area, including its coastal zone over the total number of Contracting Parties	2	2, National Reports	Increase		

LBS Protocol

Article	"narrative", Actions/Criteria	Objectives	Indicator	Description	Frequency of assessment	Frequency of data collection	Source of data and information	Relevance	Availability	Targeted trends	Year	target
Relevant to Art.6	To this end, the Parties shall provide for systems of inspection by their competent authorities to assess compliance with authorizations and regulations.	Control pollution from LBS sources	1- Ratio of the number of the total compliance reports to national standards for releases of effluent and gaseous and solid emissions over total number of reports	It indicates the trends in non conformity to national standards	Every two years	Every two years	National reports	2				
Relevant to Arts.1 and 5			2-Volume of investments in the framework of MeHSIP GEF SP, bilateral cooperation and national expenditures in Hot Spot areas	It indicates the level of the implementation of NAPs projects to address LBS in the country, the number of hot spots reduced.	Every 5 years	Every two years	MEDPOL Assessment	2				
Relevant to Arts.1 and 5	NAPs adopted by the countries are beeing implemented	Reduce pollution from major sources	3- Quantity of BOD5, Total nitrogen and Total Phosphorus releases directly or indirectly into marine environment	It indicates the trends in the reduction of inputs of pollutants	Every 5 years	Every two years	MEDPOL Assessment	2				
Relevant to Arts.1 and 5	NAPs adopted by the countries are beeing implemented	Reduce pollution from major sources	4- Quantity of toxic substances released directly or indirectly into the marine environment	It indicates the trends in the reduction of inputs of trace metals(Hg, Cd , Pb) and POPs	Every 5 years	Every two years	MEDPOL Assessment CP/RAC Assessment	2				
Relevant to Arts.1 and 6	Ratio of the number of companies applying CP/BAT/BEP over the total of companies within the sectors of activity of Annex I of the LBS Protocol	Reduce pollution from major sources	5- Share of companies, within the sectors of activity of Annex I of the Protocol, appying Cleaner Production, Best Available Techniques and /or Best Environmental Practices	It indicates the trends in applying CP/BAT and BEP by companies	Every two years	Every two years	CP/RAC Assessment	2				
Relevant to Art.8 and 12 of the convention			5- Number of substances covered by the national monitoring programme and reported	It indicates the extend of the monitoring activities	Every two years	Every two years	MEDPOL Assessment	2				

Dumping Protocol

Article	"narrative", Actions/Criteria	Objectives	Indicator	Description	Frequency	Source of data and information	Relevance	Availability	Targeted trends	Year	target
Relevant to Art.10 and guidelines			1-Ratio of the number of EIA over the number of total number of permits	It indicates the lack in the implementation the Protocol and level of implementation of Guidelines. The value should be <=1	Every two years	National reports	2				
Relevant to Guidelines			2- Number substances covered by the National Threshold Limits for Dredge materials	It indicates the extend of the implementation of related guidelines.	Every two years	MEDPOL assessment	2				
Relevant to Guidelines			3- Number substances covered by the National Threshold Limits for Fish waste	It indicates the extend of the implementation of related guidelines.	Every two years	MEDPOL assessment	2				
Relevant to Guidelines			4- Number substances covered by the National Threshold Limits for Inert Geological materials	It indicates the extend of the implementation of related guidelines.	Every two years	MEDPOL assessment	2				
Relevant to Guidelines			5- Number of substances covered by the National Threshold Limits for Platforms and man made structures	It indicates the extend of the implementation of related guidelines.	Every two years	MEDPOL assessment	2				
Relevant to Art.12			6- Number of illegal dumping cases recorded	It indicates the trends in illegal dumping	Every two years	National reports	2				

Hazardous Waste Protocol

Article	"narrative", Actions/Criteria	Objectives	Indicator	Description	Frequency of assessment	Source of data and information	Relevance	Availability	Targeted trends	Year	target
Relevant to Art.5			1- Ratio of the total amount of hazardous wastes generated to number of sites generating HW (Urban Solid waste not included)	It indicates the trends in the generation of hazardous waste and the implementation of cleaner production	Every two years	National reports- MEDPOL and CP/RAC assessments	2				
Relevant to Art.5	Ratio of the number of companies applying CP/BAT/BEP over the total of companies within the sectors generating HW (according to the Regional Plan on HW)	Reduce HW generation through CP/BAT/BEP	Share of the companies within the sectors generating HW (according to the Regional Plan on HW) applying applying Cleaner Production, Best Available Techniques and /or Best Environmental Practices	It indicates the trends in applying CP/BAT and BEP by companies generating HW	Every two years	National reports and CP/RAC assessments	2				
Relevant to Art.9			2-Number of illegal cases of transboundary movement of HW recorded	It indicates the effectiveness of customs clearance procedures	Every 2 years	National reports	2				
Relevant to Art.6			3-Ratio of the quantity of HW imported to the quantity exported	It indicates the trends in transboundary movement of HW at national and regional levels	Every two years	National reports	2				

Prevention and Emergency Protocol

Article	"narrative", Actions/Criteria	Objectives	Indicators	Relevance	Availability of data	Targeted trends	Year	Target	Lower limit
Article 3.1 (a)	The Prevention and Emergency Protocol do not contain substantive provisions related to response and prevention to marine pollution incidents. It is rather setting the proper framework for cooperation between contracting Parties to assist them implementing the relevant international conventions, rules and regulations adopted under the aegis of IMO. Therefore as a prerequisite for such cooperation to take place, it is crucial that the Mediterranean coastal States ratify relevant international rules, regulations and standards and, as per Article 3.1 (a) of the protocol, implement these.	Adopt at national level international rules, regulations and standards	number of countries having ratified relevant international conventions	2	CPs/REMPEC	increase		All CPs	Current number of ratifications
Article 4.1	One of the main objective of the Prevention and Emergency Protocol is to ensure that cooperation is established within the mediterranean region to reach prompt and effective action at national regional or subregional level in taking emergency measures to deal with pollution of the marine environment or a threat to it. Article 4 of the Prevention and Emergency protocol provides for contingency plans and other means of combatting pollution incidents.	1/Increase the level of preparedness and response to a spill	1/ number of national Contingency plans adopted/number of CPs	2				All CPs	Current number of national Contingency Plans
		2/ Test the response strategy and personnel and technical means for operations in case of emergencies	2/ number of national full-scale exercises	2	CPs/REMPEC	increase		every 5 years	Current number of full scale exercices carried out
		3/ Ensure the necessary speed and reliability, the reception, transmission and dissemination of all reports and urgent information concerning pollution incidents	3/ number of national communication exercises	2	CPs/REMPEC	increase		every 2 years	Current number of communications exercices carried out
		4/ Reduce and control accidental pollution of the marine environment from ships	4/ number of accidental spills / number of accidents	2	CPs/REMPEC	decrease		0	Current number of accidental spills (oil and HNS)
		5/ Increase the level of mutual assistance between neighboring countries	5/ number of bilateral/subregional agreements in force in the country	2	CPs/REMPEC	increase		100%	Current number of regional agreements to which a country is party
Article 4.2	Article 4.2 calls the Parties to take measures in order to ensure the effective implementation of the relevant international conventions in their capacity as flag State, port state and Coastal States, and their applicable legislation. This is also a duty of the coastal State referred to in Article 4.2 of the Prevention and Emergency Protocol.	Ensure the effective implementation of the relevant international conventions (Port State)	1/ number of ships detained/ships inspected	2	CPs	0		0	Current number of violations detected per ship inspected
			2/ number of ships inspected /number of ships calling at ports of the country	2	CPs	increase		25%	Current number of ship calling at Mediterranean ports inspected

Article 5	One field of cooperation the Prevention and Emergency Protocol advocates is sea monitoring. It encourages the countries to conduct monitoring activities to prevent, detect and combat pollution and to ensure compliance with the applicable international regulations	Develop and apply, either individually or through bilateral or multilateral cooperation, monitoring activities covering the Mediterranean Sea Area	number of days in a year where national surveillance patrols (aerial, naval, earth observation) took place	2	CPs	increase		Every day	Current number of days in a year where surveillance took place
Article 14	The Prevention and Emergency Protocol includes a specific provision on port reception facilities (Article 14), requiring the Parties to ensure that reception facilities meeting the needs of ships are available in their ports and terminals (Article 4.1). The same is required from the Parties with adequate reception facilities for pleasure craft. These facilities have to operate efficiently (article 14.3)	Establish adequate port reception facilities to collect ship's as well as pleasure craft generated wastes	1/ number of ports with adequate reception facilities/ number of commercial ports in the country	2	CPs/REMPEC	increase		100%	current number of adequate reception facilities for the collection of ships generated wastes established in the Mediterranean region
			2/ number of marina with adequate reception facilities/ number of marina in the country	2	CPs/REMPEC	increase		100%	current number of adequate reception facilities for the collection of pleasure craft generated wastes established in the Mediterranean region
Article 16	Articles 16 of the Prevention and Emergency Protocol contain a specific provision related to reception of ships in distress in ports and places of refuge, by which the Parties are required to define strategies concerning places of refuge, including ports, for ships in distress presenting a threat to the marine environment (Article 16). The same Article also requires the Parties to inform REMPEC of the measures they have adopted in this respect.	Define strategies concerning reception in places of refuge, including ports, of ships in distress presenting a threat to the marine environment	number of countries having a strategy and procedures identified	2	CPs/REMPEC	increase		100%	Current number countries where a strategy and procedures are identified

SPA and Biodiversity Protocol

Article	"narrative", Actions/Criteria	Objectives	Indicators	Relevance	Availability	Targeted trends
1 – SPA : Article 5	Creation of SPA	Increasing the conservation of biodiversity	Number of national SPA	2	2	increase
1 – SPA : Article 5	Creation of SPA	Increasing the conservation of biodiversity	Surface covered by the SPA	1	1	increase
1 – SPA : Article 6, 7, 16	Planification & Management	Increasing the conservation of biodiversity	ratio = Number of SPA with a Management Plan / Number of SPA	2	0	increase
2- Inventories : Article 15	For each action plan adopted in the framework of MAP, key habitats can be identified (nesting beaches for marine turtles)	Increasing the conservation of biodiversity	Surface of key-habitats included in SPA			increase
2-SPAMI : Article 8 & 9	Establishment of SPAMI	Increasing the conservation of biodiversity	ratio = Number of SPAMI/ Number of SPA	2	2	increase
2 – SPAMIs : Article 9	The decision IG17/13 adopted by the CP meting requires an ordinary evaluation of Each SPAMI by a specific committee, byears after its creation and at least 6 years after the first evaluation	Increasing the conservation of biodiversity	ratio=The number of SPAMIs succeding the Evaluation / number of SPAMIs	2	0	increase
3 – Protection and conservation of Species : Article 11	Protection and conservation of thretaened or endangered species	Increasing the conservation of biodiversity	Number of threatened or endangered species of Annexes II and III protected by law in each country	1	1	increase
3 – Protection and conservation of Species : Article 11, 12 & regional Action Plan	Cooperatives measures for the Protection and conservation of threatened or endangered species	Increasing the conservation of biodiversity	Number of NAP concerning threatened species of Annex II	1	1	increase
3 – Protection and conservation of Species : Article 13 and the regional Action Plan	Introduction of non-indigenous species	Increasing the conservation of biodiversity	Number of new introduced and/or alien species	1	1	decrease
3 – Protection and conservation of Species : Article 15	Inventory of species of fauna or flora that are endangered or threatened	Increasing the conservation of biodiversity	Number of respectively key-habitats and threatened species of Annexes II and III included in SPA	1	0	increase

* SAP BIO Target

Baseline

Year	target	Lower Limit	Upper limit
	increasing the number	Actual number	No Limit
	increasing the number	Present surface	25%*
	increasing the ration	Actual ratio	100%
	increasing the surface	Actual surface	
	increasing the ration	Actual ratio	50%
	increasing the ratio	0%	100%
	increasing the number	Actual number	All the species of Annexe II/III
	increasing the number	Actual number	for all the species of Annexe II
	reduce the number	No limit	Actual number
	increasing the number	0	All the species of Annexe II